# BOARD OF ELECTION COMMISSIONERS FOR THE CITY OF CHICAGO AS A DULY CONSTITUTED ELECTORAL BOARD

Objections of: NATHANIEL MOORE	)
To the Nomination Papers of: SHARON "SY" LEWIS	) ) No.: 19-EB-ALD-116 )
Candidate for the office of Alderman of the 7th Ward of the City of Chicago	) ) ) )

### FINDINGS AND DECISION

The duly constituted Electoral Board, consisting of the Board of Election Commissioners for the City of Chicago, Commissioners Marisel A. Hernandez, William J. Kresse and Jonathan T. Swain, organized by law in response to a Call issued by Marisel A. Hernandez, Chair of said Electoral Board, for the purpose of hearing and passing upon objections ("Objections") of NATHANIEL MOORE ("Objector") to the nomination papers ("Nomination Papers") of SHARON "SY" LEWIS, for the office of Alderman of the 7th Ward of the City of Chicago ("Candidate") at the General Municipal Election to be held on Tuesday, February 26, 2019, having convened on Monday, December 10, 2018 at 8:30 a.m., in Room 800, 69 West Washington Street, Chicago, Illinois, and having heard and determined the Objections to the Nomination Papers in the above-entitled matter, finds that:

- 1. Objections to the Nomination Papers of the Candidate were duly and timely filed.
- 2. The Electoral Board was legally constituted under the laws of the State of Illinois.

- 3. A Call to the hearing on said Objections was duly issued by the Chair of the Electoral Board and served upon the members of the Electoral Board, the Objector and the Candidate, by registered or certified mail and by Sheriff's service, as provided by statute.
- A public hearing held on these Objections commenced on Monday, December 10,
   2018 and was continued from time to time.
- 5. The Electoral Board assigned this matter to Hearing Officer Laura Kotelman for further hearings and proceedings.
- 6. The Objector and the Candidate were directed by the Electoral Board to appear before the Hearing Officer on the date and at the time designated in the Hearing Schedule. The following persons, among others, were present at such hearing: the Objector, NATHANIEL MOORE, and/or his attorney Randy Crumpton; and the Candidate, SHARON "SY" LEWIS, and or her Attorney, Mabel Taylor.
- 7. The Hearing Officer ordered that an examination of the voter registration records be conducted by clerks and agents under the Board's direction and supervision, in accordance with the laws of Illinois and the rules of the Board.
- 8. The Hearing Officer directed all parties to appear and be present, either personally and/or by their authorized representatives, during this records examination.
- 9. The Candidate and/or her duly authorized representative was present during the examination of the registration records.
- 10. The Objector and/or his duly authorized representative was present during the examination of the registration records.
- 11. The examination of the registration records was completed and the Electoral Board hereby adopts and incorporates by reference the results of the records examination

conducted by its clerks and agents. The written report of the result of the registration records examination is contained in the Electoral Board's file in this case and a copy has been provided or made available to the parties.

- 12. The results of the records examination indicate that:
  - A. The minimum number of valid signatures required by law for placement on the ballot for the office in question is 473;
  - B. The remaining number of signatures deemed valid as a result of the records examination total 424.
- 13. The Electoral Board finds that the number of valid signatures appearing on the Candidate's nominating petition following completion of the records examination was less than the minimum number of valid signatures required by law to be placed upon the official ballot as a candidate for the office of Alderman of the 7th Ward of the City of Chicago.
- 14. The Hearing Officer conducted a hearing to allow the Candidate an opportunity to present evidence in support of her Rule 8 motion objecting to the Board's clerk's findings during the records examination. However, upon completion of this hearing, the Candidate was still below the minimum signature requirement.
- 15. The Hearing Officer has tendered to the Electoral Board a report and recommended decision. Based upon the evidence presented, the Hearing Officer found that the Candidate's Nomination Papers contained only 424 valid signatures, which is less than the minimum number of valid signatures required by law to be placed upon the official ballot as a candidate for the office of Alderman for the 7th Ward of the City of Chicago, and that the Candidate's Nomination Papers should be found invalid.

- 16. The Electoral Board, having considered the evidence and arguments tendered by the parties and the Hearing Officer's report of recommended findings and conclusions of law, hereby adopts the Hearing Officer's recommended findings and conclusions of law.
- 17. For the reasons stated above, the Electoral Board finds that the Candidate has an insufficient number of valid signatures on her nominating petitions and that the Nomination Papers of SHARON "SY" LEWIS are, therefore, invalid.

IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED that the Objections of NATHANIEL MOORE to the Nomination Papers of SHARON "SY" LEWIS, candidate for election to the office of Alderman of the 7th Ward of the City of Chicago, are hereby SUSTAINED and said Nomination Papers are hereby declared INVALID and the name of SHARON "SY" LEWIS, candidate for the office of Alderman for the 7th Ward of the City of Chicago, SHALL NOT be printed on the official ballot for the General Municipal Election to be held on Tuesday, February 26, 2019.

Dated: Chicago, Illinois, on Tuesday, January 8, 2019

Marisel A. Hernandez, Chair

William J/Kresse, Commissioner

Jonathan T. Swain, Commissioner

NOTICE: Pursuant to Section 10-10.1 of the Election Code (10 ILCS 5/10-10.1) a party aggrieved of this decision and seeking judicial review of this decision must file a petition for judicial review with the Clerk of the Circuit Court of Cook County within 5 days after service of the decision of the Electoral Board.

## BOARD OF ELECTION COMMISSIONERS OF THE CITY OF CHICAGO AS THE DULY CONSTITUTED ELECTORAL BOARD FOR THE HEARING AND PASSING UPON OBJECTIONS TO THE NOMINATING PAPERS OF CANDIDATES FOR THE FEBRUARY 26, 2019 MUNICIPAL ELECTION FOR ALDERMAN OF THE 7th WARD IN THE CITY OF CHICAGO

NATHANIEL MOORE Objector	) ) )	
v.	) ) 19-EB-ALD-11	16
SHARON "SY" LEWIS Candidate	) ) )	
	)	

#### HEARING OFFICER'S REPORT AND RECOMMENDED DECISION

This matter was first heard on December 10, 2018 by Hearing Officer June Brown. Objector Nathaniel Moore ("Objector") filed an objection petition challenging the nominating papers for election of The Office of Alderman of the 7th Ward of the City of Chicago in the State of Illinois filed by the Candidate Sharon "Sy" Lewis ("Candidate"). The Objector appeared through counsel Randy Crumpton and the Candidate appeared through counsel Mable Taylor. Objector and Candidate counsel agreed to the request for a Rule 6 records examination. The matter was scheduled for a hearing on December 29, 2018.

#### THE RECORDS EXAMINATION

The records examination took place on December 19, 2018 at 10:00 a.m. and the final records exam report was served upon the parties through their counsel at 1:24 p.m. on December 27, 2018 via email.

The final results of the records examination were as follows:

- A. The minimum number of valid signatures required by law for placement on the ballot for the office in question is 473.
- B. The number of purportedly valid signatures appearing on the nominating petition filed by the Candidate total 973.
- C. The number of signatures deemed invalid because of objections sustained in the records examination total 579.
- D. The remaining number of signatures deemed valid as a result of the records examination total 424.

The results of the records examination indicated that the candidate had 49 signatures fewer than the statutory minimum.

## December 29, 2018 Hearing

At the December 29, 2018 hearing, the Objector and the Candidate appeared through counsel. Candidate's Rule 8 Motion was timely filed with the Board of Elections. Counsel agreed to a Rule 8 evidentiary hearing on January 5, 2019 at 1:00 p.m. with a deadline of 5:00 p.m. on January 4, 2019 for all evidence to be provided to Objector's counsel for review prior to the hearing.

## January 5, 2019 Rule 8 Evidentiary Hearing

At the January 5, 2019 hearing, the Objector and the Candidate appeared through counsel. The Candidate proceeded with her Rule 8 Motion and submitted affidavits for 53 signers. At the Hearing, Candidate withdrew two of the affidavits submitted thereby submitting 51 signer affidavits. The Objector raised an objection to five of the affidavits because the page and line number were not properly identified on the sworn document or appeared to be altered vis-à-vis the document

submitted into evidence by the 5:00 p.m. deadline on January 4, 2019. This objection was sustained thereby reducing the number of affidavits for consideration to 46.

Despite the impossibility of rehabilitating a sufficient number of signatures, the parties and the Hearing Officer agreed to begin Rule 8 Evidentiary Hearing on the remaining affidavits and reviewed a total of 11 signer affidavits. The results of the reviewed signer affidavits were as follows:

- A. Eight affidavits were for signatures not reserved in the Candidate's
  Rule 8 Motion filed timely with the Board of Elections on January 4,
  2019. Pursuant to Rule 8 (d)(ii)(2), those signer affidavits cannot be
  considered at the Rule 8 Evidentiary Hearing.
- B. Two signature objections were sustained as the voter registration signature did not match the petition and affidavit signature.
- C. One affidavit was not required as the signature objection was overruled in the Final Records Exam. It also was not reserved in the Candidate's Rule 8 Motion filed timely with the Board of Elections.

At this point, Candidate and Objector counsel agreed to conclude the evidentiary hearing. The final total signatures deemed valid after conclusion of the Rule 8 Hearing was 424.

#### **Conclusion**

Based on the foregoing, it is my recommendation that the Objector's Petition is sustained in conformity with the results of the final records examination and a finding that the nominating papers are invalid is made.

# 19-EB-ALD-116 RECOMMENDATION.pdf - 01/06/2019 9:21 am

It is my further recommendation that the nominating papers for the Candidate, Sharon "Sy" Lewis, be found invalid and that the Candidate's name, Sharon "Sy" Lewis, **not** be on the ballot at the February 26, 2019 Municipal Election.

Respectfully Submitted,

Laura Kotelman, Hearing Officer

Laun Kotelma